1 2	BEFORE THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY NASHVILLE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTH.
3	*02 FEB 11 PM 3 07
4	OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE SECRETARY
5	Box of the last of
6	IN RE: COMPLAINT OF XO TENNESSEE, INC. AGAINST BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC.
8	DOCKET NO. 01-00868
9	COMPLAINT OF ACCESS INGEGRATED
10	NETWORKS, INC. AGAINST BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC.
11	TELLCOMMONICATIONS, INC.
12	
13	
14	
15	Deposition of:
16	KATHLEEN FINN (By Phone)
17	Taken on behalf of ITC^DELTACOM
18	January 14, 2002
19	
20	
21	
22	VOWELL & JENNINGS, INC. Court Reporting Services
23	328 Washington Square Building 222 Second Avenue North
2 4	Nashville, Tennessee 37201 (615) 256-1935
25	

```
1
     APPEARANCES:
     FOR ITC^DELTACOM:
 2
 3
             HENRY WALKER
             Attorney at Law
             Nashville, Tennessee
 4
 5
             and
 6
             NANETTE EDWARDS
           Attorney at Law
 7
             Huntsville, Alabama
    FOR BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC.:
 8
 9
             PATRICK TURNER (BY PHONE)
             Attorney at Law
10
             Atlanta, Georga
11
    FOR THE OFFICE OF THE STATE ATTORNEY GENERAL:
12
             CHRIS ALLEN
             Attorney at Law
13
             Nashville, Tennessee
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

```
1
                     I N D E X
 2
    WITNESS: KATHLEEN FINN
 3
                INDEX OF EXAMINATIONS
 4
 5
    Page/Line
 6
 7
    By Mr. Walker ......
                                                2
    By Mr. Turner .....
 8
                                          18
                                               20
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
2.2
23
24
25
```

Vowell & Jennings, Inc. (615) 256-1935

```
1
                    The deposition of KATHLEEN FINN,
    taken on behalf of ITC^DELTACOM, on the 14TH
 2
    day of January, 2002, in the offices of Boult,
 3
    Cummings, Conners & Berry, Suite 1500, 414
 4
    Union Street, Nashville, Tennessee, for all
 5
    purposes under the Tennessee Rules of Civil
 6
 7
    Procedure.
 8
                    The formalities as to notice,
    caption, certificate, et cetera, are waived.
 9
                                                    All
    objections, except as to the form of the
10
    questions, are reserved to the hearing.
11
12
                    It is agreed that James L. Vowell,
    being a Notary Public and Court Reporter for the
13
    State of Tennessee, may swear the witness, and
14
15
    that the reading and signing of the completed
16
    deposition by the witness are waived.
17
18
19
20
                      KATHLEEN FINN
21
    was called as a witness, and after having been
2.2
    first duly sworn, testified follows:
23
24
25
```

1 EXAMINATION

- 2 BY MR. WALKER:
- 3 Q. State your name for the record, please,
- 4 | and where you work.
- 5 A. My name is Kathleen Finn, and I work at
- 6 | BellSouth Small Business Services.
- 7 | Q. Would you spell "Kathleen," please?
- $8 \mid A$. K-A-T-H-L-E-E-N.
- 9 Q. Okay. And what is BellSouth Small
- 10 | Business Services?
- 11 | A. It's the business unit that supports
- 12 | and provides products and services, sells
- 13 products and services to its Small Business
- 14 | Services customers.
- 15 | Q. How are Small Business customers
- 16 | defined? I mean is there a minimum or a
- 17 | maximum?
- 18 A. There is not a minimum for Small
- 19 Business customers, and I am not that familiar
- 20 | with the criteria on how high the Small
- 21 | Business customer goes.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. However, it's based upon a mix of --
- 24 number of lines as well as total bills revenue.
- 25 Q. Okay. And what is your job title

```
1
    within the Small Business Services area?
 2
            I'm senior director, sales operations.
 3
    0.
            For what territory are you responsible?
 4
            I'm not responsible for a particular
 5
    territory. I have responsibility for sales
    support for the inbound channels, and
 6
 7
    previously I had responsibility for third-
    party vendors.
 8
 9
           Was your -- first of all, is your
10
    current duty -- are you a regionwide person?
11
    Α.
            Yes, I am.
           And how long have you had your current
12
    O .
13
    job title?
14
    Α.
            About a year and three months.
15
           And prior to that you said you were in
    O .
16
    charge of third-party what?
17
    Α.
            Third-party vendors.
18
    Q.
          And when did you cease doing that?
19
            In November of 2001.
    Α.
20
           Okay. I misunderstood your earlier
    Ο.
21
    answer. I thought you said you had had your
22
    new job for more than a year?
```

Vowell & Jennings, Inc. (615) 256-1935

third-party vendor part of my job which was

existing job for a year and three months. The

I have my existing -- I have had my

2.3

24

25

- 1 about 10 percent of my job was moved to another
- 2 organization.
- 3 Q. To which organization?
- 4 A. To the outbound organization.
- 5 | Q. Do you know why that was moved?
- 6 A. The move was because of an organiza-
- 7 | tional realignment where we combined all of our
- 8 | inbound functions under one vice president and
- 9 all of our outbound functions under one vice
- 10 president.
- 11 | Q. Who heads the outbound organization
- 12 | now?
- 13 A. Sam Hastings.
- $14 \mid Q$. H-A-S-T-I-N-G-S?
- 15 A. H-A-S-T-I-N-G-S.
- MR. WALKER: Thanks.
- Patrick, do you have the sales
- 18 offer we were talking about earlier?
- MR. TURNER: Still waiting on it,
- 20 Henry.
- 21 BY MR. WALKER:
- 22 | Q. Ms. Finn, when you were working with
- 23 | third-party vendors would that have included
- 24 | calls made by Berry Direct?
- 25 A. Yes, it did.

- 1 Q. Would that have included calls by Berry
- 2 Direct throughout the region or just in certain
- 3 | states?
- 4 A. It was throughout the region.
- 5 Q. Could you describe to whom those calls
- 6 | were made?
- 7 A. The outbound calling program by Berry
- 8 Direct was for a variety of Small Business
- 9 customers, and we called customers based upon a
- 10 | list that we used from Marketing.
- 11 Q. Okay. Would these be -- would these
- 12 | include customers not currently being served by
- 13 | BellSouth?
- 14 A. Yes, it does.
- 15 | Q. Were you targeting any particular group
- 16 | of customers?
- 17 A. We had programs where we would target a
- 18 group of customers.
- 19 Q. How familiar were you with the
- 20 | BellSouth Select program?
- 21 MR. TURNER: Henry, I just want to
- 22 give you the opportunity, if you wanted to
- 23 | clarify, if you were talking Tennessee or
- 24 | regionwide with that prior question.
- MR. WALKER: I'm assuming all her

- 1 | answers are regionwide because -- and, Ms.
- 2 | Finn, correct me if I'm wrong.
- 3 BY MR. WALKER:
- 4 Q. When you say you were targeting groups
- 5 of customers, I assume that meant throughout
- 6 | the region?
- 7 A. That's correct.
- 8 Q. Would there be any reason to target
- 9 different customers in Tennessee than you would
- 10 | in other states?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Thank you.
- How familiar are you with the BellSouth
- 14 | Select program? I mean, do you -- are you
- 15 | generally knowledgeable about how it works?
- 16 A. I wouldn't consider myself real
- 17 | familiar with the BellSouth Select program.
- 18 Q. Okay. If you had questions about the
- 19 | BellSouth Select program, to whom would you go?
- 20 A. I would go to Marketing.
- 21 Q. Can you give me the name of an
- 22 | individual?
- 23 A. I would go to Don Livingston.
- 24 Q. Okay. And he's the witness who is
- 25 testifying right after you are?

```
1
                 MR. TURNER:
                              Yes.
 2
                 MR. WALKER: Okay.
                 MR. TURNER: Henry, we now have a
 3
 4
    copy of the fax that was attached to your
 5
    complaint on behalf of Access Integrated
    Networks.
 6
                 MR. WALKER: Good.
 7
    BY MR. WALKER:
 9
            Ms. Finn, if you would take a look at
10
    that, please, and I would ask you if you've
11
    ever seen it before?
12
    Α.
           Yes, I've seen this.
13
            When was the first time you saw it?
    Ο.
14
    Α.
            The first time that I saw this was when
15
    we received word that there was a complaint.
16
       How did you find out that there was a
    Q.
17
    complaint?
18
            I got a message from Marketing that
19
    there was a complaint on this particular
20
    request.
21
           Okay. So at that time, you read the
    Q.
22
    document you're holding there?
23
    Α.
            It was after I received that
24
    notification.
25
            Right. Do you see anything on that
```

- 1 document, Ms. Finn, that was inconsistent with
- 2 | BellSouth's practices and procedures that were
- 3 | in place at the time the offer was made?
- 4 A. Yes, I do.
- 5 Q. Please describe it.
- 6 MR. TURNER: Henry, if you're
- 7 | talking, we can't hear you.
- MR. WALKER: No, I'm not. I asked
- 9 the question, maybe the witness didn't hear me.
- 10 | I asked Ms. Finn to describe the
- 11 | inconsistencies that she observed.
- 12 | MR. TURNER: I'm sorry, we did not
- 13 hear that.
- Ms. Finn, you can answer that
- 15 | question, please.
- 16 THE WITNESS: The inconsistency
- 17 | with the program surrounds the front page that
- 18 | says no charge for service for this particular
- 19 | customer.
- 20 BY MR. WALKER:
- 21 Q. Why is that inconsistent with the --
- 22 | with the procedures that were in place at that
- 23 | time?
- 24 A. It was my belief that the intent of the
- 25 | Select program was to provide Select points to

```
1
    customers, that could be used for dollars off
 2
    of their bill on the deregulated portion of
    their bill.
 3
 4
            So you were unaware that the Select
    program allowed you to take points off the
 5
 6
    regulated services?
 7
    Α.
            That's correct.
            Did you later inquire as to whether or
 8
    Ο.
 9
    not the Select program allowed that or not?
10
    Let me rephrase that question, Ms. Finn.
11
            You said it was your understanding that
    Select points could be used for discounts off
12
13
    the bill. When you say "discounts off the
14
    bill, " are you referring to unregulated
1.5
    services only?
16
    A. I'm referring to the unregulated
17
    services only.
18
            Okay. Were you aware of the fact that
19
    these -- BellSouth Select program later changed
20
    its rules and allowed you to get discounts off
21
    of regulated and unregulated services?
22
    Α.
            No, I was not aware of that.
23
            If you were not aware of that, how did
    0.
```

representative, who would have instructed the Vowell & Jennings, Inc. (615) 256-1935

the offer made by the Berry Direct sales

24

25

- 1 | BellSouth -- excuse me -- who would have
- 2 | instructed the Berry Direct person to have made
- 3 | that offer?
- 4 A. I don't know who instructed the Berry
- 5 Direct representative to make that offer.
- 6 However, when we initially did training for
- 7 this program, a copy of a training document
- 8 | went to Berry Direct that was incorrect, and
- 9 | it's quite possible that that representative
- 10 used parts of that document.
- 11 Q. Who was responsible for the training
- 12 | manual?
- 13 A. Marketing.
- 14 Q. Who in Marketing?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. I'm sorry. Any particular individual?
- 17 A. The training itself was conducted by
- 18 | Sara Ducharm.
- 19 Q. You will have to spell Ducharm as best
- 20 you can.
- 21 A. I'm not sure that I know myself, but
- 22 | it's D-U-C-H-A-R-M.
- 23 Q. Is Sara with or without an H?
- 24 A. Without.
- 25 Q. When were those training materials

- 1 | distributed, do you know?
- 2 A. The documents that we are talking about
- 3 | right now was distributed prior to August 15th.
- 4 Q. Did you ever see those training
- 5 | materials?
- 6 A. Not until I was aware of this
- 7 | complaint.
- 8 Q. Why do you believe that it is improper
- 9 for the -- why do you believe that the training
- 10 | materials were in error?
- 11 | A. Because the training materials included
- 12 words such as "free service."
- 13 | Q. Well, if I can redeem my bonus points
- 14 for discounts off of my regulated services,
- 15 | would that be consistent with the way the
- 16 | program was supposed to work? What's the
- 17 difference between that and free service? I
- 18 | guess that's my question.
- 19 A. That was not my understanding.
- 20 Q. Well, all right, help me out here.
- 21 What's the difference between redeeming
- 22 your points for discounts off of your regulated
- 23 | services and free service? What's the
- 24 difference as you understand it?
- MR. TURNER: Henry, I'll let her

```
1
    answer the question. I'm not sure you
    understand what she meant by what she just
 2
    said, if you want to ask that question I'm fine
 3
 4
    with it, but I think there might have been a
 5
    disconnect there.
    BY MR. WALKER:
 6
 7
            Ms. Finn, I'm hearing you say the word
    0.
    "free service" was an inappropriate word.
 9
            And I guess my question is, if you can
    redeem your bonus points so that you're no
10
11
    longer paying for a regulated service, then
12
    what's wrong with calling that free service?
            Sir, it was not my understanding that
13
14
    this program would allow or included free
15
    service off of your regulated portion of the
16
    bill. It was my understanding that this
17
    program offered Select points that could be
18
    used against the deregulated or the
19
    nonregulated portion of the bill.
20
    Q.
            I see. Do you know whether or not at
21
    any time one could redeem Select points for
22
    cash?
23
    Α.
            For cash?
24
    Q.
            Cash. Or a check, money?
25
    Α.
            No, I'm not aware of that.
```

Vowell & Jennings, Inc. (615) 256-1935

- 1 Q. Who developed the training materials
- 2 | that you have said were erroneous? Not who
- 3 administered them but who developed them?
- 4 A. Marketing.
- 5 Q. Who in marketing?
- 6 A. I believe it was Sara Ducharm.
- 7 Q. Do you know what, if any, role
- 8 Mr. Livingston played in the development of
- 9 those training materials?
- 10 A. Sara reports to Don Livingston.
- 11 Q. All right. Why do you believe that she
- 12 developed it and not Mr. Livingston?
- 13 A. She's a manager that works for Don, and
- 14 | I know that she delivered the training.
- 15 Q. But my question, remember, was not who
- 16 delivered it, but who prepared it? And is it
- 17 | your answer that Ms. Ducharm prepared it?
- 18 A. I believe she prepared it.
- 19 Q. And she works in Marketing and Don
- 20 Livingston is her boss?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. Not directly, but there are a couple of
- 24 other managers in between.
- 25 Q. Who would have been responsible for

```
reviewing these training materials to see if
 1
 2
    they complied with legal and regulatory
 3
    requirements?
                 MR. TURNER: Henry, what was the
 5
    first part of that question? I heard the last,
    but you faded out on the first.
    BY MR. WALKER:
 7
 8
    Ο.
           Who would have been responsible for
    reviewing those training materials to see if
10
    they complied with regulatory and legal
11
    requirements?
12
            Marketing would be responsible.
    Α.
13
            Well, who within Marketing?
    Q.
14
            The organization that was delivering
    the training and that developed the training.
15
16
            When I say who, I'm asking for the name
    Q.
17
    of a person. If you don't know, you don't
18
    know, but when I say who, I don't mean a thing,
19
    I mean a name.
20
            I'm not sure who would be overall
    Α.
21
    responsible for requiring that.
22
            Is it fair to assume, Ms. Finn, that
23
    you never reviewed those training materials?
```

MR. WALKER: I think that's all

That's correct.

24

2.5

Α.

```
Patrick. I'm going to turn it over to Nanette.
 1
 2
                 MS. EDWARDS: I don't have any
 3
    questions.
                 MR. WALKER: Nanette says she has
 5
    no questions. Chris has no questions.
                 MR. TURNER: All right, let me do
 6
    this: I would like to get my notes ready, and
 7
    I want to tell you what I want to do. If there
 9
    is no objection from you, I want to ask Ms.
10
    Finn to step outside the room where Bert and I
11
    are sitting, put you on mute, Bert and I will
12
    figure out if there is anything we need to ask;
13
    at that point we'll put you back on and bring
14
    Ms. Finn back in the room, unless there is some
15
    objection to that.
16
                 MR. WALKER:
                              No.
                                   Thank you.
17
                     TURNER: Okay, thank y'all.
                 MR.
18
                 (Brief respite.)
19
                 EXAMINATION
20
    BY MR. TURNER:
21
            Ms. Finn, as you know, I'm Patrick
22
    Turner, and I have just a couple of questions
23
    about what you spoke with Mr. Walker about.
24
            Let me ask you this, first: Today, are
25
    third-party vendors, like Berry Direct selling,
```

```
1 | the -- anything that's akin to the what has
```

- 2 been characterized as three months of free
- 3 | service offering?
- 4 A. No, they're not.
- 5 Q. To the best of your knowledge, when
- 6 approximately is the last date that any of
- 7 these third-party vendors were selling that
- 8 combined offering regarding the Select program?
- 9 A. I believe we discontinued as soon as we
- 10 understood there was a complaint.
- 11 Q. Okay. Now, you mentioned Ms. Ducharm
- 12 as a person who may have -- when asked who in
- 13 Marketing may have done the training materials,
- 14 "Ms. Ducharm" was your answer. I just want to
- 15 clarify.
- 16 Do you know for a fact it was
- 17 Ms. Ducharm or is that your best guess, given
- 18 | what you know about the circumstances?
- 19 A. That's my best guess.
- 20 Q. Did I hear it properly when you said
- 21 | that Ms. Ducharm is within Mr. Livingston's
- 22 organization?
- 23 A. That's correct.
- 24 Q. So if Mr. Livingston were to name
- 25 someone other than Ms. Ducharm as the person

```
who wrote those materials, would you have any
 1
    reason to take issue with what Mr. Livingston
 2
 3
    said?
           Not necessarily.
 4
    Α.
            Okay. As I understood what you said,
 5
    0.
    there was some training materials that went to
    the third-party vendors, including Berry
 7
    Direct, that you said described this as an
 8.
    offering involving free service. Do you
    remember that?
10
           Yes, I do.
11
    Α.
12
           Do you know whether that is the only
    set of training materials that was provided to
13
14
    the third-party vendors?
15
    Α.
           No, it's not.
16
            On the day that the training was
17
    delivered, the new documents were taken to
18
    Berry Direct that did not include words such as
19
    "free service."
20
    Q. Do you know whether the training
    materials that did mention free service, do you
21
22
    know whether they were delivered to Berry
23
    Direct before or after the actual training in
24
    which materials that did not include that
25
    language were used to train Berry Direct?
```

1	
1	A. They were delivered before.
2	Q. So just to make sure, the training
3	materials with the words "free service" were
4	delivered to Berry Direct before Berry Direct
5	was actually trained on the program in a
6	training session, do I have that right?
7	A. That's correct.
8	MR. TURNER: Henry, that's all I
9	have.
10	MR. WALKER: Okay. Let's go get
11	Mr. Livingston in.
12	FURTHER DEPONENT SAITH NOT.
13	
14	SWORN to before me when taken, January 14, 2002
15	
16	
17	Times I Nowell
18	James L. Vowell Notary Public
19	State of Tennessee At Large My Commission Expires: 11/30/02
20	
21	
2,2	
23	
24	
25	